

## **HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING**

City Council Chambers

February 17, 2015

### CALL TO ORDER – ITEM 1:

A regular meeting of the Astoria Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) was held at the above place at the hour of 5:15 p.m.

### ROLL CALL – ITEM 2:

Commissioners Present: President LJ Gunderson, Vice President Michelle Dieffenbach, Commissioners Jack Osterberg, Thomas Stanley, Paul Caruana, Mac Burns, and Kevin McHone.

Commissioners Excused: None

Staff Present: Interim Planner Mike Morgan and Administrative Assistant Sherri Williams.

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES – ITEM 3(a):

President Gunderson asked if there were any changes to the minutes of the January 20, 2015 meeting. There was none.

Commissioner Stanley moved to approve the minutes of January 20, 2015 as presented; seconded by Commissioner Burns. Ayes: President Gunderson, Vice President Dieffenbach, Commissioners Caruana, Osterberg, Burns, Stanley, and McHone. Nays: None.

### PUBLIC HEARINGS:

President Gunderson explained the procedures governing the conduct of public hearings to the audience and advised that the substantive review criteria were listed in the Staff report. She noted for the record the only person in the audience was Derrick from the *Daily Astorian*.

### ITEM 4(a):

EX15-01 Exterior Alteration EX15-01 by Kathleen A. Karan to remove masonry chimney on a structure designated as historic at 1121 11<sup>th</sup> Street in the R-1 Zone.

President Gunderson asked if anyone objected to the jurisdiction of the HLC to hear this matter at this time. There were no objections. President Gunderson asked if any member of the HLC had a conflict of interest, or any ex parte contacts to declare. None declared. President Gunderson requested a presentation of the Staff report.

Interim Planner Morgan presented the Staff report, displaying photos of the subject house. Staff recommended approval of the request. No correspondence has been received.

Vice President Dieffenbach asked what the chimney was made of. Interim Planner Morgan replied brick with a stucco veneer.

President Gunderson opened public testimony for the hearing. Seeing that the Applicant was not present and there was no one in the audience, she closed the public testimony portion of the hearing and called for Commission discussion and deliberation.

Commissioner Osterberg said he supported the request. The historic inventory does not refer to a chimney on that house, so he concluded that it had not been identified as special decorative feature or key to the historic integrity of the house, which made him comfortable with Staff's recommendation.

Commissioners Burns, McHone, Stanley, Caruana, and Vice President Dieffenbach also supported the request.

President Gunderson did not want to see the chimney removed. She researched this house because in the past, a chimney on a house in another historic neighborhood was removed because the contractor did not believe it had historic significance. She spoke with John Goodenberger, who said he trusted Joe Herman's judgment about this chimney. However, she did not want to see a gas stove pipe installed in place of the chimney later and recommended a condition of approval accordingly.

Interim Planner Morgan believed a new chimney or anything that would protrude through the roof would need to be reviewed by the HLC. If the Applicant were to install a gas fireplace, the vent would most likely be installed through the wall.

Vice President Dieffenbach said she had never seen a chimney on a historic home of this age that had deteriorated but would still be safe during a seismic event. Rebuilding a chimney is very expensive. She did not like to see the chimneys removed, but there is really nothing else that can be done from a safety and economic standpoint.

President Gunderson appreciated Vice President Dieffenbach's comments. She had looked into this issue and asked questions because she is not expert on chimneys. She was concerned because the City has had issues with chimneys being removed in the past.

Vice President Dieffenbach agreed that making decisions on chimneys is difficult because so many different factors can come into play.

Commissioner Stanley agreed that an economic impact forces people to do the opposite of what the HLC wants, which is to restore historic homes. He believed Joe Herman Masonry is to fireplaces what John Goodenberger is to homes.

President Gunderson explained she approved of the request, but wanted to note she had done some research first.

Vice President Dieffenbach moved that the Historic Landmarks Commission adopt the Findings and Conclusions contained in the Staff report and approve Exterior Alteration EX15-01 by Kathleen A. Karan; seconded by Commissioner Caruana. Motion passed unanimously.

President Gunderson read the rules of appeal into the record.

#### OLD BUSINESS – ITEM 5(a):

##### Update on Appeal of New Construction Request by Columbia Bank

Administrative Assistant Williams gave copies of a handout to the Commissioners. Interim Planner Morgan said he received an email from the architect, which suggested the use of slate colored standing seam metal or blue ceramic tile roofing as an alternative to the blue standing seam metal that was rejected by the HLC. He told the architect the City preferred the two darkest colored materials.

The Commissioners agreed they would prefer to have sample materials rather than photographs to review. Interim Planner Morgan understood that the choice of material could be approved by Staff and a public hearing was not necessary. However, he would ask Columbia Bank to send sample materials for the HLC to review.

After some discussion about the overall look of the pyramid feature on the roof, President Gunderson said she would defer to Commissioner Caruana and Vice President Dieffenbach on the choice of roofing material because roofing was their expertise.

Interim Planner Morgan offered to make sample materials available to the Commissioners to review at their convenience. He believed the material could be approved by Staff, but he wanted to approve a material the HLC was comfortable with.



#### STATUS REPORTS – ITEM 6(a):

Interim Planner Morgan has included status report photographs of the following: EX12-02 for 1483 Duane, HD14-01 for 778 38<sup>th</sup> Street. All projects are complete and conditions have been met. These status report photographs are for Commission information.

#### ITEMS NOT ON AGENDA

Interim Planner Morgan explained that an Applicant who is building a new structure in the Shively-McClure neighborhood has not been able to find recessed windows that comply with the City's guidelines. He asked for direction from the HLC about how to advise the Applicant.

Commissioner Osterberg suggested the architect design the building to accommodate standard windows that would be recessed.

Commissioner Caruana said the windows would need to be installed with an offset flange. The windows would be set into the wall slightly deeper and a deeper trim would create the relief. Or, flangeless windows could be set as deep as one wanted. He believed the architect could resolve this issue.

Interim Planner Morgan confirmed the project would be reviewed by the HLC because the project involves new construction in a historic area. The owners want to come to the HLC with a project that can be approved.

Commissioner Stanley said it would be helpful to review Ted Osborn's project, which was also new construction in a historic neighborhood. President Gunderson added that the guidelines for the Shively-McClure neighborhood would be similar to Mill Pond's because both neighborhoods were in the Gateway Overlay Zone.

The Commissioners discussed past projects for which they required recessed windows. Vice President Dieffenbach noted that without seeing the design of the house, it is difficult to determine what type of windows the house should have. The HLC must review the overall look and character of new houses, not the specific details that are reviewed on historic homes.

Interim Planner Morgan said he would do some research and speak with Mr. Osborn and former Planner Rosemary Johnson.

#### WEBINAR

Sherri Williams said Staff had received an email from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) about a free online class on historic windows. She requested more information about the class and would forward the information to Commissioners through email.

#### ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:46 p.m.

ATTEST:

  
Secretary

APPROVED:

  
Interim Planner